

THE UNDERLYING CAUSES OF INSTITUTIONAL INSTABILITY AND ITS IMPACTS ON THE STUDENTS' PERFORMANCE IN THE UNIVERSITY OF BALOCHISTAN

Dr. Muhammad Rahim

Lecturer, Department of Sociology, University of Balochistan, Quetta.

Email ID: rahim.sociology@um.uob.edu.pk

Dr. Aurangzaib Alizai

Assistant Professor, Department of Gender and Development Study, University of Balochistan, Quetta.

Email ID: aurangzaib.alizai@gmail.com

Dr. Syed Amir Shah

Lecturer Department of Political Sciences, University of Balochistan, Quetta.

Email ID: amir.polscience@um.uob.edu.pk

Abstract

Balochistan as a province is passing through uncertain situation. The law and order situation is deteriorating, which has affected all spheres of life including educational institutions and especially the university of Balochistan. However, there are more other factors which are responsible for weakening the university's stability. Contextually, this study was conducted in the university of Balochistan to explore the fundamental causes of the institutional instability and their impacts on the students' performance. UoB is the oldest and largest university of the province facing instability. In this regard the data was collected from the students of Balochistan university to know their attitude about this issue. The finding concluded there are multifaceted factors taking the stability of the university at stake, like the inefficiency of the administration, the interference of political organizations, favoritism, teachers' disinterest in classes and the outdated nature of the syllabuses. Moreover, the study concluded that the instability of the university effecting the teaching quality, leading students to desperation and frustration, reducing students' attendance, causing incomplete courses and other kinds of fears among the students. It is suggested further that it is high time to take strict steps and stern actions to save university otherwise it will lead to subversive ends.

Key words: - Institutional instability, Students' performance, Educational institutions, UoB

Introduction

Instability in the institution refers to the unpredictable changes that occur in the formal and informal rules of the institutions, which govern political, economic and social aspects of the institution, causing the state of uncertainty and failure, and ultimately weakening the governance (Acemoglu & Robinson, 2012; North, 1990). Contextually, educational institutions play significant role in fortifying political stability, economic booming, and social harmony. However, when there is instability in the institutions, resultantly this dysfunctional would lead to chaos and disharmony and the students will not be able to pursue their dreams and definitely their future will be at stake (Fukuyama, 2014). Institutional instability comes into existence when the state or government tilt towards the fewer families or the elite class, neglecting the lower or working class, turning society towards the instability and even subvert the entire system (Huntington, 1968; Przeworski, 1991). Moreover, the unnecessary changes in the constitution, unpredictable amendments, failure in evolving stable policies and their enforcement on citizens especially in the educational institutions are the indicators triggering instability in the institutions (Rodrik, 1999).

Instability in the educational institutions is primarily caused due to higher corruption, unplanned economy and abrupt changes in the leadership (Helmke & Levitsky, 2012). It is a serious problem affecting students' learning and performance, downing their motivation and outcome level which at the end culminates on their weak achievements. The study further portray that political interference, financial limitations, the unjustified education policies and

frequent changes in the administrative portfolios are the contributing factors to unstable learning environment, which ultimately demoralize students and leading to the high rate of dropout, lowering academic performance and weakening the institutional trust (Altbach, Reisberg & Rumbley, 2019). Studies in this regard communicate that universities facing institutional instability often struggle with insufficient infrastructure, irregular academic schedules and poor governance are ultimately decreasing students' enrolment and success ratio (Henard & Roseveare, 2012). Consequent upon, this move is instrumental in the failure of a government when it is unable to provide incentives which the people need for their investment and innovation (Acemoglu & Robinson, 2012). Weak institutions are more likely to come in the grip of the conflicts, when violence outburst and go out of the control. The education system which is run poorly or politicized causing distances among the folk and failing to unify the people (Collier, 2007; Heyneman, 2011).

Institutional instability besides having negative impacts on the students' achievements also keeping on stake the professors' future. Research studies disseminate that with the weakness of educational institutions the professors equipped with knowledge resign and try to join stable universities, leaving adverse impacts on the institutions left behind (Academics without borders, 2024). UNESCO reports that the institutions pass through five years' consecutive instable situation keep lingering impacts, distancing them quit far from the destination, and however this situation will take several years to stable again. Moreover, it is feared that there would be new changes and challenges in future doubling the embarrassment (GEDI, 2024).

Review of Literature

The students learning is directly linked with the teachers' caliber. In this regard a study indicates that low quality teaching lowering the students' motivation and leading to high rate of dropout and causing more absenteeism. Furthermore, the students are more prone to dropout when the teachers are incompetent (Gershenson et al., 2017). The students who cannot read or perform well in basic math by the age of 10 is showing the incompetence of the teacher (Rivkin & Hanushek, 2006). Moreover, the deprived students are disproportionately affected by the ineffective teaching, which as a result shaking the students' achievements and targets. It is further argued that in the educational institutions the minority and low income students are assigned the incapable teachers which consequently exacerbate the incompetence level (Sorensen & Ladd, 2017). It is additionally communicated that increasing enrolment rate and fund availability is adversely affected by the trust of the people when it is attached with the low qualification of the teachers. The school's reputation and the parents' trust is always attached with the efficiency of the teachers (Darling-Hammond, 2000). Expending money on the quality of teaching and teachers would definitely yield professional development (Murnane & Steele, 2007).

Nevertheless, poor administration leads institution towards destabilizing ends. The situation takes institution to poor accountability, mismanagement, the unfair division of funds and also to bureaucratic inefficiencies, however, supportive leadership encourage the teachers and improve their morale level (Hallinger & Heck, 1996; Ingersoll, 2003). The neglected classrooms, the broken materials and inadequate facilities showing the inefficiency of management. A good administrator keeps in focus to enhance the learning environment and remain always fair in resources allocation (Opalka, 2010). A study conducted by the Robinson et al., (2008) as a meta-analysis demonstrated that the instructional leadership has profound impacts on the students learning. It is further concluded that this type of leadership has three to four times additional impact on the students' capacity building than the transformational leadership. But on the other side the poor administration triggering major flaws causing classrooms disturbance, behavioral issues and the high level of absenteeism. Moreover, the

administration with clear rule, fair enforcement of rules and school maintenance improve the students focus. Consequently, strong administrative leadership is positively correlated with the higher test scores and graduation ratio (Marzano et al., 2005).

For the smooth running of an institution there is dire need of funds. However, when there is funding issues the stability of the institution is kept on stake. The institution in this situation postponed the infrastructure improvements, reducing academic staff and lessening students support services (Altbach, 2006), which nonetheless keep negative impacts on enhancement of the enrolment rate; and similarly the staff turnover brings reduction in the teaching quality and boosting the students' dissatisfaction level leading to further destabilization of the institution. Besides this the financial instability also hurdling the formation of long standing strategies. In this regard the institution should work proactively. Otherwise the reactive nature of the institutions would yield inconsistent policies, weak administration and flop results ultimately, and it is further contented that for luminous future the institutions should move with the technological advancement and modern educational trends (Breneman, 2001). Nevertheless, when there is limited funds the institutions try to maintain classrooms, computer labs, libraries, internet connectivity and hygienic facilities hardly. Contrary to this when there is deteriorating condition of physical infrastructure, that reduces standard of education and causing students and faculty to stay away from the institution (UNESCO, 2015). The financial crises moreover bar institution to offer handsome salaries, financial benefits and provide opportunities to improve the employees' careers. This as a result triggering the "brain drain" of the talented academics and administrative staff to join lucrative institutions abroad and pursue their goals (Teferra & Altbach, 2004).

Study objectives

Followings were the objectives set for this study

1. To explore the prominent causes leading university of Balochistan towards instability
2. To understanding that how the instable position of UoB effecting the students' overall performance

Methods and Materials

This study was carried out about the fundamental causes of institutional instability at UoB and their impacts on the students' academic performance. The study was conducted through the quantitative research technique of social research. Survey method was employed to collect data from the students of the Balochistan university. Locale for the study was the UoB campus. The data was collected through distributing a well-structured questionnaire among the students, consisting of completely close-ended questions. However, some of the questionnaires were filled through google form from the same university students. Respondents for the study were both male and female students of different departments. The sample size for the study was 300 respondents, which consists of 200 male students and 100 female students/respondents. Sampling technique for the study best suited as disproportionate stratified simple random sampling. The data was analyzed through SPSS version 23. The data was first entered into data sheet then given codes to all variables and later on various tables was formed to clearly classify all variables. The tables were finally interpreted in simple words to disseminate in easily to the readers.

Results and Findings

About the personal profile of the respondents, as per the study report that the study respondents were from all departments of the university. They include the students from first semester to 10th semesters, however, majority of the respondents were from 8th semester. Ages of the respondents ranges from 19 years to 27 years. Nevertheless, majority of the respondents included in the study were from 23, 24 and 25 years.

Attitude of the respondents regarding the causes of institutional instability at UoB

S#	Statement	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
I	Syllabuses of the universities are outdated and do not fulfil demands of the modern era.	(122) 40.6%	(90) 30%	(14) 4.6%	(50) 16.6%	(24) 8%
II	The disinterest of teachers in classes are disappointing the students to attend the classes	(146) 48.6%	(114) 38%	(02) 0.6%	(28) 9.3%	(10) 3.3%
III	Weak administrative environment demotivating the students which reflects poor performance among the students.	(138) 46%	(122) 40.6%	(00) 0%	(28) 9.3%	(12) 4%
IV	In the university of Balochistan some students use illegal ways to supersede other competitors.	(116) 38.6%	(154) 51.3%	(06) 2%	(20) 6.6%	(04) 1.3%
V	Delaying the results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level.	(150) 50%	(128) 42.6%	(06) 2%	(12) 4%	(04) 1.3%
VI	In the Balochistan university The females are more vulnerable to harass.	(78) 26.6%	(59) 17.5%	(00) 0%	(101) 34.6%	(62) 21.3%
VII	The institutional instability is caused due to external deteriorating law and order situation in the province.	(132) 44%	(114) 38%	(10) 3.3%	(38) 12.6%	(06) 2%
VIII	Students political organizations interrupt classes and the exams process leading to institutional instability.	(114) 38%	(94) 31.4%	(00) 0%	(66) 22%	(26) 8.6%
IX	Lack of the interest of governmental in universities is effecting the institutional progress	(142) 47.3%	(112) 37.3%	(12) 4%	(22) 7.3%	(12) 7.3%

The above table explains data about the causes of institutional instability in the university of Balochistan. In this scenario various questions were put in front of the respondents. The respondents answered these questions on their own behalf. The respondents were asked that the syllabuses of the university are outdated and do not fulfil demands of the modern era. In this respect, huge number of the respondents replied with the affirmation. Consequent upon 40.6% of the respondents strongly agreed with the upper assertion. Additionally, 30% of the respondents agreed with the statement. However, 16.6% of the respondents responded with the disagree option, moreover, 8% of the respondents strongly disagreed and lastly 4.6% of the respondents neither agreed nor disagreed with the statement.

It is further narrated that the disinterest of teachers in the classes are disappointing students to attend classes. Regarding this question 48.6% of the respondents strongly agreed with the declaration that the disinterest of teachers in the classes are disappointing students to attend the classes. Nevertheless, 38% of the respondents replied that they are agree with the statement. But, on the contrary 9.3% of the respondents showed the disagreement attitude regarding the statement. Additionally, 3.3% of the respondents expressed that they are strongly disagree with the statement and only .6% of the respondents opted the neutral option.

In the table it is moreover depicted the data that weak administrative environment demotivating students which reflect poor performance among the students. In this connection 46% of the respondents strongly agreed with the statement that weak administrative environment demotivating students which reflect poor performance among the students.

Nonetheless, 40.6% of the respondents viewed that they are agree with the above statement. While 9.3% of the respondents shared that they are disagree in this regard and only 4% of the respondents strongly disagreed with the proclamation.

The data regarding the statement that in the university of Balochistan some students use illegal ways to supersede other competitors. Contextually, 51.6% of the respondents showed their agreement with the assertion that in the university of Balochistan some students use illegal ways to supersede other competitors. Furthermore, 38.6% of the respondents communicated that they are strongly agree with the statement. However, in the contrary, 6.6% of the respondents depicted that they are disagree with the above proclamation. Moreover, 2% of the respondents neither agreed nor disagreed and only 1.3% of the respondents expressed that they are strongly disagree with the claim.

The table in next elaborate data the delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level. With reference this question around all of the respondents viewed positively. Resultantly, 50% of the respondents shared that they are strongly agree with the statement that delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level. Nevertheless, 42.6% of the respondents responded that they are agree. Moreover, 4% of the respondents disagreed with the declaration. In same way 2% of the respondents opted the neutral option and only 1.3% of the respondents replied through the strongly disagree option.

The data in the table next reveal that in Balochistan university the females are more vulnerable to harass. Owing to this 34.6% of the respondents communicated that they are disagree with the statement that in Balochistan university the females are more vulnerable to harass. Moreover, 26.6% of the respondents strongly agreed with the assertion. Contrarily, 21.3% of the respondents strongly disagreed with the statement. While, 17.3% of the respondents expressed that they are agree with the statement.

The table further elucidate data that institutional instability is caused due to external deteriorating law and order situation in the province. In this scenario 44% of the respondents shared that they are strongly agree with the claim that institutional instability is caused due to external deteriorating law and order situation in the province. Similarly, 38% of the respondents answered that they are agree with the statement, but on the other side 12.6% of the respondents viewed that they are disagree with the statement, however, 3.3% of the respondents communicated that they are neither agree nor disagree with the statement and only 2% of the respondents showed strongly disagreement in this regard.

Regarding the statement that the students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exam process leading to institutional instability, 38% of the respondents expressed that they are strongly agree with the proclamation that students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exam process leading to institutional instability. In addition, 31.3% of the respondents depicted that they are agree with the statement. But on the contrary, 22% of the respondents disagreed with the statement and 8.6% of the respondents replied that they are strongly disagree in this way.

At the end the table communicate data that lack of the interest of government in universities is effecting the institutional progress. In this respect 47.3% of the respondents strongly agreed that lack of the interest of government in universities is effecting the institutional progress. Moreover, 37.3% of the respondents viewed that they are agree with the statement. Nonetheless, 7.3% of the respondents shared that they are disagree with the declaration. Similarly, 7.3% of the respondents strongly disagreed with the statement and only 4% of the respondent answered through neutral option.

Attitude of the respondents regarding the impacts of institutional instability on the students' performance

S#	Statement	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
I	Institutional instability affects the quality of education and teaching-learning process at UoB.	(148) 49.3%	(120) 40%	(14) 4.6%	(08) 2.6%	(10) 3.3%
II	Instability at the universities leading students towards desperation and frustration	(126) 42%	(144) 48%	(14) 4.6%	(10) 3.3%	(06) 02%
III	The students in the university are anxious about their future	(132) 44%	(100) 33.3%	(20) 6.6%	(34) 11.3%	(14) 4.6%
IV	The frequent strikes, protests and mutual fights increasing the anxiety level of students.	(150) 50%	(100) 33.3%	(28) 9.3%	(18) 06%	(04) 1.3%
V	The institutional instability reducing the interest and presence of students in the classes	(144) 48%	(108) 36%	(20) 6.6%	(26) 8.6%	(02) 0.6%
VI	The sporadic closure of university causes many times the courses remain incomplete during the semesters	(148) 49.3%	(120) 40%	(16) 5.3%	(14) 4.6%	(02) 0.6%
VII	You feel fear that your degree is losing value owing to the university's poor reputation	(72) 24%	(70) 23.4%	(24) 8%	(98) 32.6%	(36) 12%

Data in the table elaborate the impacts of institutional instability on the students' performance. Regarding this a number of questions were asked from the study sample. In this connection the respondents were questioned that the institutional instability affects the quality of education and teaching-learning process. Replying this question 49.3% viewed that they are strongly agree with the assertion that the institutional instability affects the quality of education and teaching-learning process. In addition, 40% of the respondents shared that they are agree with the statement. However, 4.6% of the respondents opted the neutral option in this regard. Moreover, 3.3% of the respondents depicted that they are strongly disagree and 2.6% of the respondents disagreed with the statement.

Data in the table next illuminate that instability at the universities leading students towards desperation and frustration. Consequent upon, 48% and 42% of the respondents agreed and strongly agreed respectively with the claim that instability at the universities leading students towards desperation and frustration. However, 4.6% of the respondents neither agreed nor disagreed, but 3.3% of the respondents expressed that they are disagree and only 2% of the respondents viewed that they are strongly disagree with the statement.

Regarding the question that the students in the universities are anxious about their future the data in the table reveal that 44% of the respondents answered that they are strongly agree with the statement that the students in the universities are anxious about their future. Furthermore, 33.3% of the respondents shared that they are agree in this respect, but on the contrary 11.3% of the respondents responded otherwise and they told that they are disagree with the declaration. Nonetheless, 6.6% of the respondents opted the middle option and 4.6% of the respondents strongly disagreed with the statement.

The tabulated data in the next phase asking question that the frequent strikes, protest and natural fights increasing the anxiety level of students. In this way 50% and 33.3% of the respondents showed their strongly agreement and agreement respectively with the statement that the frequent strikes, protests and mutual fights increasing the anxiety level of students. However, 9.3% of the respondents neither agree nor disagree, but 6% of the respondents

answered that they are disagree with the claim and 1.3% of the respondents strongly disagree with the statement.

The data in the table elaborate further that the institutional instability reducing interest and presence of the students in classes. In this relation 48% and 36% of the respondents communicated that they are strongly agree and agree with the assertion respectively that the institutional instability reducing interest and presence of the students in classes. Moreover, 8.6% of the respondents disagreed with the statement, however, 6.6% of the respondents neither agreed nor disagreed and only .6% of the respondents expressed that they are strongly disagree with the declaration.

Regarding question in the table that the sporadic closure of universities causes many times the courses remain incomplete during semesters, a huge number of the respondents affirmed the claim. In this respect 49.3% of the respondents viewed that they are strongly agree with the statement that the sporadic closure of universities causes many times the courses remain incomplete during semesters. Furthermore, 40% of the respondents responded that they are agree with the proclamation. But 5.3% of the respondents opted the neutral option. However, 4.6% of the respondents disagreed and .6% of the respondents strongly disagreed with the statement.

At the end the table explains data about the statement that you feel fear that your degree is losing value owing to the university's poor reputation. Referring to this question 32.6% of the respondents disagreed with the assertion that they feel fear that their degree is losing value owing to the university's poor reputation. But on the contrary 24% of the respondents strongly agreed with the statement and in addition to this 23.3% of the respondents shared that they are agree in this way, but on the other hand 12% of the respondents strongly disagreed and only 8% of the respondents opted the neutral option regarding this claim.

Correlation between the delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level and the students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exam process leading to institutional instability

Delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level.	Students political organizations interrupt classes and the exams process leading to institutional instability.	
	Pearson correlation	.229**
	Total number	300

*and**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 and 0.001 levels [2-tailed]

The tabulated data illuminates that delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level and the students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exams process leading to institutional instability where ($r = .229^{**}$ $p < 0.01$). In this connection, the above values indicate that there is positive correlation between delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level and the students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exams process leading to institutional instability having the p-value less than 0.001, that concludes the correlation is significant. By inferences it directs that change in the attitude of the respondents concerning to delaying results and degree issuances by the university increasing the students' dissatisfaction level is expected to have the same effect on the students' political organizations interrupt classes and the exams process leading to institutional instability.

Correlation between the instability at the university leading students towards desperation and frustration and the institutional instability reducing interest and presence of the students in classes

	The institutional instability reducing interest and presence of the students in classes
--	---

Instability at the university leading students towards desperation and frustration	Pearson correlation	.355**
	Total number	300

*and**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 and 0.001 levels [2-tailed]

The table describes data that instability at the university leading students towards depression and frustration and the institutional instability that reducing the interest and presence of the students in classes where ($r = .355^{**}$ $p < 0.01$). In this respect, the said values disseminate that there is a positive correlation between the assertions that instability at the university leading students towards desperation and frustration and the institutional instability that reducing the interest and presence of students in the classes, with the p-value less than 0.001, which illuminate that the correlation is significant. By implications it communicates that change in the responses of the respondents regarding instability at the university leading students towards desperation and frustration is expected to have an equivalent effect on the institutional instability reducing interest and presence of the students in classes.

Discussion

Institutional instability found very common among those societies which are passing through critical situations. Balochistan in this context is in tight grip of uncertainty and insurgency, effecting the largest and oldest university of the province. This study was conducted for the purpose to examine the underlying causes of institutional instability and their impacts on students learning. In this context it was found that the teachers are not showing more interest in the classes, leading students to disappointment, desperation, and absenteeism. Moreover, the weak administration are demotivating students to continue their studies. The administration is failed to conduct exams on time and handle the strike, protests and agitations on time. Similarly, it was found the contents and syllabuses are more outdated and do not meet demands of the modern era, which need to be updated. Furthermore, the political interference is also one of the prominent figure causing instability in the university of Balochistan. Additionally, the external deteriorating condition of the province is also contributing to weaken the university reputation and lack of the government interest beside is the key cause stigmatizing the university's name and fame. Nevertheless, regarding the impacts of the university instability on the students' performance the quality of education and teaching-learning process effected very badly, which ultimately lead the students towards different kind of psychological issues like desperation and frustration. Such situation causes the students victim of anxiety and fear about their future. In addition to this the instability at UoB reducing the interest and presence of students in the classes. In the same way the data found that the university is more often passes through sporadic closure downing the confidence of the students, which undoubtedly many times triggering the courses remain incomplete in due sphere of time or in the complete semester. Furthermore, this terrific situation promotes fear among the students of their degrees losing value in the future.

Conclusion and Suggestions

Instability is a failure of the system in other words. It undermines the whole structure of any institution. It is caused most often due to weak leadership, the disinterest of the functionaries in the institution or some time due to external worse situation. However, once the institution led towards instability then it will take much time to re-establish that institution. The university of Balochistan is the largest and oldest university of the province. Due to external situation and the internal turmoil this institution always remains in limelight. The talented and qualified professors leaving this university and joining other universities of the country and abroad for stable future. The situation is indeed alarming, however, that can be changed when sincere and pragmatic steps are taken towards progress. In this scenario the government should provide the

required fund to the university. The universities are more research institutions than the teaching ones. So, in this connection the government should provide research fund and make university as an asset not liability. The more consume on university the more it will provide opportunities and revenue generation. Furthermore, strict rules and strong administration can control the situation in a better way. Right man should be placed on the right place and everything should be dealt in a professional way.

References

- Altbach, P. G., Reisberg, L., & Rumbley, L. E. (2019). *Trends in global higher education: Tracking an academic revolution* (Vol. 22). Brill.
- Breneman, D. W. (2001). The outputs of higher education. In *Futures Forum*.
- Collier, P. (2009). The political economy of fragile states and implications for European development policy. *Background paper for European Report on Development*.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2000). Teacher quality and student achievement. *Education policy analysis archives*, 8, 1-1.
- Elfert, M. (2015). UNESCO, the Faure report, the Delors report, and the political utopia of lifelong learning. *European Journal of Education*, 50(1), 88-100.
- Forest, J. J., & Altbach, P. G. (Eds.). (2006). *International handbook of higher education* (Vol. 1). Dordrecht: Springer.
- Fukuyama, F. (2014). America in decay: The sources of political dysfunction. *Foreign Aff.*, 93, 5.
- Gershenson, S., Jacknowitz, A., & Brannegan, A. (2017). Are student absences worth the worry in US primary schools? *Education Finance and Policy*, 12(2), 137-165.
- Hallinger, P., & Heck, R. H. (1996). Reassessing the principal's role in school effectiveness: A review of empirical research, 1980-1995. *Educational administration quarterly*, 32(1), 5-44.
- Hanushek, E. A., & Rivkin, S. G. (2006). School quality and the black-white achievement gap.
- Helmke, G., & Levitsky, S. (2012). *Informal institutions and comparative politics: A research agenda*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Hénard, F., & Roseveare, D. (2012). Fostering quality teaching in higher education: Policies and practices. *An IMHE guide for higher education institutions*, 1(1), 7-11.
- Heyneman, S. P. (2011). The concern with corruption in higher education. In *Creating the Ethical Academy* (pp. 25-38). Routledge.
- Ingersoll, R. (2003). Is there really a teacher shortage?
- Ladd, H. F., & Sorensen, L. C. (2017). Returns to teacher experience: Student achievement and motivation in middle school. *Education Finance and Policy*, 12(2), 241-279.
- Marzano, R. J., Waters, T., & McNulty, B. A. (2005). *School leadership that works: From research to results*. ASCD.
- Murnane, R. J., & Steele, J. L. (2007). What is the problem? The challenge of providing effective teachers for all children. *The future of Children*, 15-43.
- North, D. C. (1990). *Institutions, institutional change and economic performance*. Cambridge university press.
- Opalka, B. (2017). Social Services of self-government units and financing of the local and regional development. *Economic and Social Development: Book of Proceedings*, 110-119.
- Przeworski, A. (1991). The “East” becomes the “South”? The “autumn of the people” and the future of eastern Europe. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 24(1), 20-24.
- Robinson, J. A., & Acemoglu, D. (2012). *Why nations fail: The origins of power, prosperity and poverty* (pp. 45-47). London: Profile.

- Robinson, V. M., Lloyd, C. A., & Rowe, K. J. (2008). The impact of leadership on student outcomes: An analysis of the differential effects of leadership types. *Educational administration quarterly*, 44(5), 635-674.
- Rodrik, D. (1999). Where did all the growth go? External shocks, social conflict, and growth collapses. *Journal of economic growth*, 4(4), 385-412.
- Teferra, D., & Altbachl, P. G. (2004). African higher education: Challenges for the 21st century. *Higher education*, 47(1), 21-50.