

## A STUDY OF IDEOLOGICAL SHIFTS OF PAKISTAN PEOPLE'S PARTY FROM SOCIALISM TO PRAGMATISM (1967-2024)

**Hina Nayab**

MPhil Scholar, Department of History and pak study, University of Sargodha , Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan.

[hinanayab103@gmail.com](mailto:hinanayab103@gmail.com)

**Shahid Raza Prince**

MPhil Scholar, Department of History and pak study, University of Sargodha , Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan.

[shahidrazanss@gmail.com](mailto:shahidrazanss@gmail.com)

### Abstract

*The political parties are not just a group of people but they have a clear organization structure, ideas, beliefs & interests which make a party individual from existing once. The presence of political parties are necessary to run the modern democratic structural government. The political parties work for the organizational structure of the country, its masses and play a crucial role to run the government. Political actors and parties have often had to face the complex realities leading to the rise of “pragmatism” which provides a guiding structure to the political arena. Pragmatism in politics refers to the adoption of a practical and realistic approach toward political affairs, where decisions are shaped by what works best for gaining strength from the masses and avoid being stuck on their rigid ideological commitments. Socialism is a political & economic idea of Karl Marx. The Socialist goal is to cooperate and serve society collectively. It was against the ideas of capitalism whose central goal is to own private property and to earn more profit. In the Socialistic society big industries, public Utilities & natural resources should be owned & controlled by the state. So that state should manage the economy for the benefit of the common good. This global socialist influence can't be exempted from Pakistan. Pakistan suffering under the one-men authoritarian rule so, socialism considered as the solution to deep rooted economic problems created by the Ayub Khan military regime. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto emerged as a prominent figure who decided to led the foundation of **Pakistan People's party** founded on 30 November 1967 on the basis of the Socialistic ideology of Karl Marx and sought to introduce a locally and culturally acceptable form of socialism in Pakistan. But this socialist approach was challenged by several right wing groups like ML,JI,JUP & JUI political parties; according to them Socialism was “un-Islamic”. Further Z.A Bhutto supports his ideology by giving the example that the word “**Democracy**” used for “**jamhuuriyat**” so why not the word “**Socialism**” used as “**maswat**”. Socialism based on Masawat which is taught by Islam teaching. The Pakistan People's Party during the period of 1970 to 1977 frequently used slogans like “Roti, Kapra & Makan” to attract the working class of Pakistan. During Zia-ul-Haq's military regime he encouraged Islamic norms and tried to counter Bhutto's Socialist ideology. The Pakistan People's party Pragmatism approach reflects during the time period of 2002-2008 when they decided to cooperate with the PML-N right wing party and signed the “Charter of democracy” in April 2006 which aimed to revive civilian politics and prevent future military interventions. Later on Benazir Bhutto strategically negotiated with Musharraf under the National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) the re-enter into the political landscape. The Pragmatic orientation reached its fullest expression in the decade from 2008 to 2024 which may be called the “**era of Pragmatism**”. During these years the party continuously prioritised practical, context-driven decision making over rigid ideological commitments of the Pakistan peoples party. This pragmatic approach helped PPP to become the first political party to complete its full civil government term(2008-2013)and still played a crucial role as an oppositional party. This article aims to study the ideological evolution of Pakistan People's Party and examine the ideological shift of PPP from socialism towards a more pragmatic political approach. This research traces the shift in the ideology under the various leadership phases of Pakistan People's party starts from Z.A Bhutto, Benazir Bhutto, Asif Ali Zardari till Bilawal Bhutto. The study tries to highlight how changing political pressures, global conditions and domestic realities reshaped the party's orientation. In doing so this study not only fills a gap in the existing literature on party ideology of Pakistan People's Party and its pragmatic approach in Pakistan, but also offers a framework for understanding how political parties balance ideals with practical governance needs.*

### Keywords:

Pakistan People's Party, Socialism, Pragmatism, Political ideology, Bhutto, Democratic Politics

## 1.Introduction

At the time of the 20th century, the world was divided into three major blocs.

The Capitalist bloc led by the United States, the second was the socialist bloc led by the Soviet Union, and the newly independent post-colonial Countries, inclusive Pakistan.

The first and second bloc tried to influence the political & economic ideologies of third world countries. During the decade of 1960s, under the military regime of Ayub Khan, Pakistan experienced significant industrialization and economic growth which encouraged industrialization and was commonly known as “**the decade of development**”. But those changes also caused inequality, poverty, and frustration among workers and the lower middle class because most of Ayub’s policies favoured 22 influential elite families which caused social division.

At the time, the instability and political vacuum provoked Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto to lay the foundation of a new political party namely Pakistan People's Party and introduced populist Socialist ideology in Pakistan, which helped to stabilize the Social and economic conditions of Pakistan.

## 2.Background behind the formation of new political party

There were several factors behind the format of the Pakistan People's Party, but one of the most significant was the Tashkent Declaration.

Pakistan under Field Marshal Ayub Khan’s military regime (1958–1969) faced the war of 1965 during that time Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto who belongs to a politically backed feudal elite family served as foreign minister of Pakistan under the military regime of Ayub Khan.

- Firstly he served as the Minister of Commerce (1958–1960).
- Secondly Z.A Bhutto served as the Minister of Fuel Power and Natural Resources (1960–1962).
- Lastly he served as the Minister of Foreign Affairs (1963–1966).

While working as the Foreign affairs Minister, he gained huge popularity among the masses of Pakistan. The reason behind this popularity was his active participation in the defending of the Kashmir issue, at international platforms like the United Nations. Z.A Bhutto also gained huge popularity in West Pakistan, Bhutto was becoming very popular even within the army.

The year 1965 marked the decline of Ayub Khan’s popularity and the rise of Bhutto.

Pakistan faced a serious clash with India on the issues of Rann of Kutch, a border area between India’s Gujarat state and Pakistan’s Sindh province.

In June 1965, a Boundary Commission was formed to settle the Rann of Kutch dispute, but its decision gave a larger portion of land to India.

This decision disappointed Pakistan, but Pakistan planned Operation Gibraltar, Z.A Bhutto strongly supported Operation Gibraltar but this plan failed because many fighters sent to Kashmir were captured by Indian forces, this increasing tension between India & Pakistan set the stage for the Indo-Pakistan war of 1965.

### 2:1 The Tashkent Declaration & Social unrest in Pakistan

The Prime Minister Kosygin of the Soviet Union played a role of mediator between India & Pakistan to stop the war of 1965. Ayub Khan left for Tashkent on January 3, 1966 along with Z.A Bhutto and other senior officials.

During the speech Ayub Khan did not mention the words “**Jammu and Kashmir dispute**” which clearly reflect that Ayub was avoiding the Kashmir issue. Due to which Pakistan's position on Kashmir stance was weak. During that time the disagreement between Ayub and Z.A Bhutto became very serious. Z.A Bhutto strongly insisted that the Kashmir dispute must be solved, but Ayub Khan officially signed the Tashkent Declaration on January 10, 1966.

## 2:2 Protests against Ayub Khan

When the terms of Tashkent Declaration publicly announced the people of West Pakistan were shocked and angry. Large protests against the military regime of Ayub Khan led by the people of Punjab and Sindh, Police violence also noticed during the student protest in Lahore, two of the students were killed despite repression, protests continued, and this period permanently changed Bhutto's Political Career. Ayub Khan lost public support even China who was the close ally of Pakistan also unsatisfied due to Ayub's acceptance of Soviet mediation.

This Social and political vacuum of Pakistan forced Zulfikar Ali Bhutto to lay the foundation of Pakistan People's party on the basis of a Socialistic agenda. People of Pakistan was angry due to Tashkent Declaration so Bhutto shifted this aggression to strengthen his political power, by his powerful speech, fiery attacks on Ayub Khan when he celebrated his 10th anniversary of military rule and spending a lot of public money, he highlights that government was wasting money the huge protest start from Karachi University on October, 1968.

Z.A Bhutto left the office of Foreign affairs Ministership and Bhutto led student riots against the dictatorship of Ayub Khan which helped Bhutto to prepare himself to launch his own political party.

He officially left the cabinet in June 1966 and spent the next year carefully planning and strategy for which political direction he should take. Bhutto tilted towards leftist ideas after deep studying the country's political and economic problems. Firstly Bhutto suggested creating a "**forward Bloc**" within Ayub's convention Muslim league but party leaders rejected this idea later on Bhutto believed none of the parties matched his ambition of the leftist.

Many leftist figures such as J.A. Rahim, Dr. Mubasher Hasan, Mukhtar Rana, Mairaj Muhammad Khan, K.H. Meer, Sheikh Rashid, Taj Mohammad inspired by Z.A Bhutto's strong criticism of imperialism, nationalist approach and his bold stand after Tashkent.

They encouraged him to form his own political party due to the strong supporters base of Z.A Bhutto to the grassroots level, like workers, students, professional groups supporting him due to his anti-Ayub dictatorship campaign and resignation to his cabinet office.

## 3. Socialism in the Pakistani politics

Z.A Bhutto likes to choose Socialistic ideas of equality, fraternity and the end of exploitation. According to him Socialism was the only solution to eradicate the equality within the masses of Pakistan.

## 4. Literature Review

Daivid S. Mason in his book stated that the roots of socialism, which later shaped many post-colonial politics can be traced to the broader ideological developments of nineteenth-century Europe; the publication of The Communist Manifesto in 1848 marked the formal emergence of socialism as a force for political and economic change. Marx and Engels called for a worldwide workers' movement that would challenge capitalism and establish a system in which property was publicly owned and economic resources were distributed equitably among the masses.

Benish Khan In her article discussed Socialism as a philosophy of Karl Marx, a western Philosopher. According to Marxist ideology, everyone has a right to use the assets of the State and the political system of the country is to be based on socialism. Socialist ideology mostly deals with state, economic & Social issues. Sayed Akmal Hussain Shah argued that Pakistan from the very beginning had a Top-down one-man political system.

Power revolved around powerful individuals. The coup of 1958 led by Ayub Khan, a period of military & bureaucratic control which weakened politics and led to the economic instability, Civil unrest and finally, the division of Pakistan in 1971 after creation of

Bangladesh. This issue caused social frustration & political anger and the vacuum of power made a space to be filled up by a new political party namely Pakistan People's Party (PPP). It was a reaction to decades of one-man rule, military domination and political breakdown. The political party is a group of people who come together to gain political power.

They make a program that shows their beliefs, ideology and goals. This plan guides what the political parties do if they win elections?

During the 1970s Pakistan faced a competition of different ideologies one of them was Socialism which was the central ideology of Pakistan Political Party (PPP). Due to dominating religious tendency in the Society of Pakistan, socialism gradually shaped toward "Islamic Socialism".

Musawal-i-Muhammadi and ideas associated with Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The Pakistan people's party founded by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto on November 30, 1967 in Lahore was a party of important political thinkers like Nabeel Hasan, J.A. Rahim, Masraj Muhammad Khan, Murtaza Bhutto, Rafi Raza, Sherpao Mustafa Khar, and Hayat Sherpao.

A slogan like: "**Islam is our faith; Democracy is our system; Socialism is our economy; all power vested to the People**".

For the attraction of ordinary People Pakistan people's party adopted the slogan of "**Roti, Kapra aur Makan**". After the 1970s election the ideology of PPP was the major topic of discussion in the country so they mixed "Socialism" with "Islam" and formed the ideology of "Islamic Socialism" and named it as "Bhuttoism". Dr. Maleeha Lodhi stated that People of Pakistan were angry due to the Tashkent agreement after the war of 1965. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto former Foreign Minister Shifted this rising critic's, fiery attacks against Ayub Khan to form his own political party, Bhutto highlighted the lavish expenditure of Ayub Khan when he celebrated 10th anniversary of his powerful rule he started a huge protest from Karachi university in October 1968.

After this nationwide agitational protests were started. Socialism introduced in the Pakistan society by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto faced a serious drawback by religious parties, Socialism had no concern with religion Islam.

During the period of 1968 to 1969 people across Pakistan came together in huge protest movements against dictatorship but at the same time they have different thoughts about their fairer future, more equality and the end of injustice. That's why the slogan of 'socialism' became popular in the masses of Pakistan because it reflects hope for justice and equality.

Sandharo Raza & Jalil Ahmed explain about the election of 1970; all the political parties actively participated because during Ayub's coup PRODA (Public Representatives Disqualification act) banned many political leaders from participating in the elections for Six years (until 1966).

During the 1970s elections East and West Pakistan were two major powers.

A strong argument developed between secular minded politicians like Bhutto & Religious leaders like Maulana Maudoodi (believed in an Islamic/sharia political system). Religious parties accused PPP as a party of socialism; they argued that Socialism was "**Un-Islamic**".

But according to Bhutto socialism could solve the problems of the poor masses of Pakistan. The PPP party published articles and newspapers to spread the ideas of Islamic socialism.

A magazine like "**Nusrat and Musawat**" played an important role in promoting PPP ideology. The party tried to reach & connect to every section of society. Muhammad Dawood & Kasif Shahzad discussed Z.A Bhutto as the first chairman of Pakistan people's party participated in the 1970s election but in Jan 1971, Awami League won most seats but Yahya Khan refused to transfer power.

The Awami League leading party in East Pakistan used force which led to a bloody Civil war. Indian army also involved and East Pak separated and emerged on the map of the world



with the name of Bangladesh on 16 Dec, 1971. Farooq Shujaat in his book argued that Z.A Bhutto first became Civilian chief martial law administrator and later the Prime Minister on 14 August 1973 .

PPP's Government lasted from 20Dec, 1971 to 05 July,1977. During 1970 to 1977 Peoples party used popular political slogans like Islamic Socialism“Roti, Kapra aur Makan” and the “Nizam-e-Mustafa”but General Zia-ul-Haq military regime (1977-88) try to resist political parties so, most of them were in active and religious parties to promote Islamic rules and counter Bhutto's Socialist influence and to promote his own Afghan Jihad policy between 1988-1999 the country held multiple elections during this time period and Pakistan people's party shift their ideological position and start recognizing the role of private sector and deregulation. Chawla & Aman Ullah in their article

Bakhtir khan in his article highlighting the role of Benazir Bhutto against the Zia non-party basis elections, Benazir Bhutto challenged this decision in the Supreme Court and on October 2, 1988, the Court ruled that elections must be held on a party basis.

PPP decided to contest the elections independently without forming any alliances Movement for the restoration of Democracy (MRD) Islami Jamhoori Ittehad by Nawaz Sharif. PPP won 94 seats in the National Assembly while (IJI) won 56 seats while (MQM) got 13 seats. However, PPP has no absolute majority in the country.

So, the PPP made a coalition government; it was the start of a new democratic era. Benazir highlights Z.A Bhutto's legacy but she balanced it by using negotiation & compromise because the expectations of that time were high. Benazir worked with different political groups like MQM Coalition with Awami National Party (ANP) in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Due to political pressure, coalition dynamics and economic limitations, Benazir's ambition towards socialism and promotion of her father Z.A Bhutto policy couldn't be implemented. Azeem & Mukhtar in their article discussing the imprisonment and execution of her father brought Benazir in the political arena and followed her father's political ideas and aimed to revive democracy in Pakistan.

During her two terms as Prime Minister (1988-1992) and (1993-1996), she made important decisions and worked cooperatively with other institutions & political groups. During the first term of Govt. Benazir took a pragmatic step to work with the military accepting some of their demands to form her government but later she tried to replace ISI chief which created hostile civil-Military relations.

Benazir was re-elected in 1993 but her relationship with Farooq Leghari became tense on the issue of appointment of the Army chief.

During her two terms as Prime Minister, she tried to improve Pakistan's economy; she established the Board of Investment, started the Peoples Work Program to maintain PPP's socialistic stance; started economic welfare programs for women, focused on agriculture, energy, road construction, telecommunication and attracting foreign investment.

However, her performance was affected by challenges like military influence struggles with the President, poverty, unemployment, illiteracy, regional disparities and opposition politics; she worked to modernize Pakistan while respecting Islamic values. Zia had applied Islamic orthodox approach but Benazir transformed the Pakistan society into a modern Islamic society.

Khaurshed Begum in his journal discussed about pragmatism .

The PPP pragmatic approach was highlighted during the Musharraf period when the PPP decided to collaborate with PML-N to work together against Musharraf's military rule. In April, 2006, they signed an agreement called the Charter of Democracy (CoD) for revival of civilian Democracy. But Benazir again shifted her approach after signing the Secret agreement with Musharraf in the name of National Reconciliation ordinance (NRO) on 5 Oct

2007 which dropped criminal cases of Benazir during 1988 to 1999 and allowed Benazir & other political leaders to return towards Pakistani politics.

In the role of Pakistan People's party In this article authors called the 2008 to 2018 period as a period of (Pragmatism) based on practical decisions of the Pakistan people's party instead of strictly following rigid ideologies in this decade of Pragmatism

PPP made decisions that were practical and suitable according to the needs of that time. This article discussed how PPP entered its fifth decade with the assassination of Benazir Bhutto after her death. Asif Ali Zardari and Bilawal Bhutto became Co-chairman of the PPP after winning the 2008 general elections the PPP emerged as the ruling party and adopt more practical and balanced approach towards political issues and it was the first time in the Pakistan political history that elected Government complete its five-year term from (2008 to 2013) and later became the main opposition party in parliament from (2013 to 2018) .

Then they discussed the 18th and 19th Amendment and how PPP's pragmatic approach reflects in it. The Pakistan people's party also took great steps to combat the threats of terrorism and used both military and non-military tactics. They were dealing with Tahir-ul-Qadri's anti-government demonstrations. In March 2013, the peaceful transfer of power reflected a clear pragmatic approach from PM Mr. Raja Parvez Ashraf to Prime Minister Mr. Hazar Khan Khoso but PPP did not contest well in the 2013 national elections due to this they were unable to keep its Parliamentary majority.

After the 2013 election PPP established a provincial government in Sindh with the MQM in coalition. During 2015 they embraced a pragmatic approach to politics during the 2015 senate elections and PPP contributed positively to constitutional amendments from 2013-2018.

In the 2018 election PPP employed a practical strategy to win and maintain a solid majority in the upper house of the Parliament.

PPP during 2018 to 2022 tried to become a strong opposition party in the national politics mainly focused on provincial development in sindh. PPP mostly focused on opposition politics and mobilized their supporters through promoting PPP policies. After the 2018 elections, Bilawal Bhutto Zardari became the chairman of the PPP and was appointed as foreign Minister in the new government. Traditionally PPP & PML-N are political rivals but when PTI won the 2018 elections PPP and PML-N joined other parties and formed the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) an anti-government coalition but due to poor coordination between parties PPP later officially left the PDM but still cooperates with other political parties.

### **5. Theoretical Framework**

This journal focuses on the major phases of the Pakistan People's Party history, starting with Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's era when socialist ideas became the ideology based on the new party.

Then examines Benazir Bhutto's leadership, where the party tried to balance its traditional ideology with the political and economic challenges of a changing world.

The final part of the study explores the period after 2007, under Asif Ali Zardari and Bilawal Bhutto-Zardari, when the PPP increasingly adopted a pragmatic approach to manage coalition politics, institutional pressures, and governance challenges.

This study does more than describe these events but it tries to look at how shifting ideology influenced the party's policies, election campaigns, alliances, and overall political identity.

It highlights the efforts of PPP when it tried to appeal to different social groups, respond to economic and political crises, and maintain its role as a major national political force.

While the central focus of research revolved around PPP's ideological shift from socialism to pragmatism.

## 6. Methodology

This Research Proposal uses a qualitative research approach to explore how the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) shift their ideological approach from socialism to pragmatism. The research relies mainly on secondary data, including party manifestos, leadership speeches, academic books, journal articles, and social media reports. The sources were examined through deep analysis to identify socialistic ideology, policy changes, and ideological patterns across different phases of PPP leadership. It also uses descriptive methods and applied methods due to application of socialist ideology of Karl Marx in Pakistan politics. But the central focus of the study was to examine the ideological shifts of the Pakistan people's party so there were no clear primary sources found regarding this but this gap was filled with the deep analysis of Secondary data. So, this descriptive part of this study focuses on tracing the evolution of PPP's ideology across different leadership eras.

## 7. Formation of Pakistan People's Party

J.A Rahim, former ICS officer and diplomat, became the main party thinker and strategist with the support of Mubashir Hassan, Ghulam Mustafa Khar, Mumtaz Ali Bhutto, Hayat Mohammad Sherpao, Mairaj Mohammad Khan, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto laid the foundation of Pakistan People's Party (PPP) on December 01, 1967 at the house of grandson of great poet Altaf Hussain Hali, Dr. Mubashir Hassan.

### 7:1 Aims and objectives of Pakistan People's Party

At the founding meeting, Z.A Bhutto explained the aims and objectives of the party.

- Highlights Ayub's failures.
- Recognized the poor masses of Pakistan as the backbone of the country.
- Criticized opposition parties for neglecting the middle class.
- Pointing towards religious scholars who interfered in politics.

### 7:2 Basic principle of Pakistan People's Party (PPP)

Z.A Bhutto introduced the basic principle of PPP.

- a. Islam is our faith
- b. Democracy is our policy
- c. Socialism is our economy
- d. Power belongs to the people.

Those principles are often called the basic “**four pillars of PPP**”.

(1) Islam teaches peace, love, brotherhood and tolerance so PPP is going to follow the teachings of Sufi saints of simplicity and avoid the use of force.

(2) PPP values freedom, human rights and Democracy.

(3) The adoption of Socialism ideology reflects that PPP wants a fair economy where everyone has equal rights. PPP committed to freedom and fundamental rights

PPP aim to reduce the growing gap between the rich and the poor masses of Pakistan.

The PPP emerged as a party who voice for poor, working class and middle class rights. PPP wants a balanced economy where business can grow freely but the government ensures everyone has employment opportunities, improves health care, grows in the literary rate through educational reforms and protects natural reserves.

(4) The people decide the future of the country because all power vested to the masses of Pakistan.

His famous slogans: **Roti, kapra aur Makan** (Food, Clothing, and shelter) reflect his desire of Social quality which improves the lives of ordinary people.

An Ideology only becomes meaningful if it can adjust to new challenges and still stay useful and fulfil the modern day needs.

A major feature of Bhutto's politics was flexibility. He believed that situations change with time so political ideas should also be changed. Z.A Bhutto believed that real political ideas must be proven through action not just through theories like Karl Marx.

### 7:3 Criticism on Socialistic ideology

During 1970s Pakistan faced a competition of different set of ideologies one of them was Socialism which was the central ideology of Pakistan People's Party but due to the dominating religious tendencies in the society of Pakistan Pakistan People's Party face huge criticism from several religious groups they considered PPP as un-Islamic and they used to call Bhutto as Kafir. Different religious scholars issued "**Fatwa**" against the Socialistic ideology of PPP.

Almost 113 Ulama groups mainly including Deobandi scholars, Ahl-e-Hadith and Shia Scholars joined together against Pakistan People's Party Socialism.

### 7:4 Criticism against Socialism

- According to Fatwa, Socialism is a Cursed Ideology.
- Everyone who supports this ideology is going to rebel from Allah and the Quran.
- Giving votes to Socialistic agenda parties like the Pakistan People's Party is one of the major sins.
- Socialism is un-Islamic and to be forbidden from Pakistani society.
- "**Socialism kufr hai, Muslim milat aik ho**"

(slogans like socialism is un-Islamic so the whole Muslim community jointly struggles to protest against it).

Karl Marx theory about Socialism that provides an explanation that all people should have "**equal rights**" to use the resources of their country and the "**political system**" should be based on equality. Pakistan People's Party after the adoption of Socialism considered that this was the only solution to fight against "**poverty**" and the "**exploitation**" of our country.

Due to the firm belief of Muslim on the oneness of God it is difficult to adjust purely secular ideology like western socialism to gain full acceptance in the society of Pakistan.

Due to this religious scholars criticize it but Z.A Bhutto adopts several voice steps which help PPP to adjust in the society.

### 8. The concept "Islamic socialism"

The Pakistan People's Party tried to "**combine**" Islam with Socialism.

The new idea was called Islamic Socialism. Major difference between Islamic Socialism & western Socialism explain by Z.A Bhutto is that:

**Western Socialism** is based only on economic principles and it completely ignores religion.

**Islamic Socialism** tried to work within the religious teachings of Islam.

Z.A Bhutto as the Chairman of Pakistan People's Party defended its party ideology by accusing Secular Socialism and declaring that they have no link with atheist form of socialism

PPP's efforts to gain public support from various constituency

#### Sindh

In Sindh, the PPP clearly spoke against feudal lords and promised to improve the lives of the ordinary masses.

#### Karachi

In Karachi, the PPP explained the ideas of Islamic Socialism and appeal support from factory workers

#### N.W.F.P

In N.W.F.P they spoke about Socialist revolution.

Pakistan People's Party believe Socialism could solve the problems of the poor masses so to reach the grassroot audience the published article and newspaper namely "**Nusrat**" and



“**Musawat**” which translate the international speeches of Social thinkers and translate them into Urdu which play a crucial role during PPP election campaign of 1970s.

## 9. The introduction of “Musawat-i-Muhhamdi”

During the election campaign PPP strategically promoted the concept of Musawat-i-Muhammadi. PPP leaders like Hanif Ramay, Maulana kausar Niazi, Maulana Gulam Rasul and prof. Fateg Muhammad Malik support the idea of Muswat-i-Muhammadi which mean Equality taught and practised by Holy Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H).

This was a political strategy used right before the 1970s elections to maintain their popularity and counter-religious groups protested against Socialism groups like ML, JI, JUP and JUI etc. On 28 November 1969, General Yahya Khan announced that the General Elections were originally planned on 05 Oct 1970. He also announced that the “**One-Unit system**” of western Pakistan would be ended. But due to flooding in East Pakistan in August 1970, elections were delayed. NA Election held on 07 Dec, 1970

**East Pakistan** (Awami League) under the leadership of Sheikh Mujibur Rahman won 160 seats.

**West Pakistan** (Pakistan People's Party) under the chairmanship of Z.A Bhutto won 81 seats. East Pakistan wanted a central Government but General Yahya Khan refused to hand over power to Sheikh Mujibur Rahman military intervention and due to support of India East Pakistan separated with the name of “**Bangladesh**” on 16 December, 1971.

General Yahya Khan handed power to Z.A Bhutto as President and Chief Martial law administrator (CMLA) on 20th Dec, 1971.

Because during that time the country had no constitution.

When the new constitution was enforced on 14 August, 1973 Z.A Bhutto appointed Fazal ilahi Chudary as President and he himself appointed as Prime Minister of Pakistan.

## 10. Policies of Z.A Bhutto as Prime Minister

1. Appointment of Muhammad Hanif Khan and the Minister of labor reforms.
2. Appointing Shaikh Muhammad Rashid as the land Minister.
3. Limits on agriculture land holdings were set for canal-irrigated land; the limit was 150 to 500 acres while for rain-fed land the limit was 300 to 1000 acres.
4. Introduction of Nationalisation of industries, including 31 firms and 10 basic industries were nationalized.
5. Private industries must be nationalized under the control of the government.
6. Private trade replaced by Civil-servants.
7. Unused lands given to the poor masses of Pakistan including full ownership rights.
8. The Government Grants Committee is formed to improve and facilitate education institutions.
9. Uniform curriculum introduced across the country.
10. Banks were nationalized on 1 Jan, 1974.
11. The Government granted the right of a passport to every citizen of Pakistan.
12. Z.A Bhutto hosted the second organization of Islamic conference (OIC) in 1974 at Lahore.
13. Promote Anti-SEATO policy and choose non-aligned foreign policy and withdraw from SEATO and CENTO.
14. Strengthen ties with Arab countries and support them during the Arab-Israeli conflict.
15. PPP aims to reduce Pakistan dependency on the United States.
16. Gaining military assistance from Iran.

During 1972-1972 private industrialists rejected the nationalization policy of the Government.

Pakistan currency fell by 56.7%.

While spending millions of rupees on education, the literary rate only increased 26% to 27% .  
Corruption & mismanagement allegations were started.

FSF loyal Pera force made in 1972 which used to counter opposition.

The trade Unions were suppressed after 1974.

Bhutto forced many senior generals,he dismissed many officers and tried to reduce ISI autonomy which damaged the stability of the country.

Bhutto dismissed the Provincial government of Balochistan, insurgency was started and many soldiers died so the military resented Z.A Bhutto because he used military forces to counter his political opponents. During 1974-1976 many founding members of PPP left Bhutto due to political differences. Protests and civil disorder erupted in Lahore, and the PPP lost administration control of the country. To control instability,the central Government dismissed two provincial governments within six months. The government arrested two chief ministers,two governors,and 4 MNAs and MPAs.

Islamic Socialism lasted for roughly two years from (1972-1974) because it linked with the “**State capital system**” where the government controlled much of the economy.

When PPP declared the Ahmadis as non-Muslims this decision marked the end of Islamic socialism as the guiding ideology of PPP and it was the beginning of a new phase in PPP politics where no longer a clear ideology be followed which reflected pragmatism.

#### **10:1 General Election of 1977**

During 1970s PPP dominated by workers, students, leftist trade union leaders and grassroots activists but at the time of 1977 Z.A Bhutto distributed party tickets to landlord, industrialists,and traditional elite which disappoint grassroots people of Pakistan but on Jan 1977 Bhutto won 54% voted but opposition like PNA & JUI blame Bhutto for rigging in the general Elections which led to the Civil

disobedience which ended up after the imposition of Martial law led by Zai-ul-Haq on July05,1977.

Later on Z.A Bhutto was arrested on 03 September1977 on the charges of authorizing the murder of a political opponent Mehmood Raza Khan Kasuri.

#### **11. Leadership Dynamics and Benazir Bhutto’s Political Legacy**

Benazir Bhutto the daughter of charismatic leader Z.A Bhutto was born on June 24, 1953 in a political family. She studied in the United States and returned to Pakistan in 1977.

In the same year, Z.A Bhutto faced allegations of rigging in the general election of 1977, which led to the rise of PNA agitation and martial law imposed by Zia-ul-Haq. After the Bhutto's execution on April14,1979.Benazir & her mother were kept under house arrest.

Z.A Bhutto legacy revolves around always trusting the people and working for their rights and equity which was followed by Benazir Bhutto.

After Z.A Bhutto’s death, Benazir decided to carry forward his father's political ideology in the political framework of PPP. She turned 70 Clifton into the headquarters of the PPP, because of the Bhutto name, PPP members began to trust Benazir’s leadership.

When Benazir returned the people of Pakistan became hopeful because they had suffered for almost nine years under the strict military rule of Zia-ul-Haq. PPP regained popularity despite restrictions under Zia rule but PPP won local elections across Pakistan.

#### **11:1 Zia-ul-Haq and his efforts to weaken the political parties position**

Due to the grounding popularity of PPP and the opposition,Zia-ul-Haq cancelled the scheduled NA elections. The Zia-ul-Haq government tried to weaken the PPP Political position by placing Benazir Bhutto and Nusrat Bhutto under house arrest.

### **11:2 Pragmatic step of Benazir toward joining the Movement of Restore Democracy (MRD) alliance**

Benazir tried to strengthen the political position through the alliance of Movement to Restore Democracy (MRD). The MRD alliance gained nationwide public support.

The PPP continued its struggle through political meetings and strikes under strict surveillance.

According to the constitution, new elections should be held within 90 days but Zia announced the election date for November 1988 and also announced that the elections would be held on the non-party basis Benazir Bhutto challenged the non-party based elections by filing the petition in supreme court.

Zia-ul-Haq died in a plane crash on 17 August 1988 later on supreme court allowed party-based elections before October 2, 1988 polls.

### **11:3 Campaign of PPP at the time general election 1988s**

For spreading the socialist ideology of PPP in the grassroots level Benazir made different wings like women, lawyers, doctors, farmers & different cultural wings.

About 1,370 candidates contested for 217 National Assembly seats.

Election campaigns lasted for one month as a result PPP won (92) seats due to Benazir people's friendly and popular campaign.

After this the acting president Gulam Ishaq Khan invited the PPP to form the government.

The PPP formed alliances with other political parties to get majority power.

With the co-operation of eight MQM members and 13 federally administered tribal area members, an alliance with ANP in N.W.F.P after this PPP showed a clear majority.

## **12. The world first serving Islamic Country female Prime Minister of Pakistan Benazir Bhutto**

On Dec 4, 1988, Benazir Bhutto became the world's first female PM of a Muslim Country.

She served as PM twice, her first term being 1988-90 and then again from 1993-1996.

### **12:1 Reforms of Benazir Bhutto during her first term of rule.**

1. Her ambitious social reforms aims to improve Pakistan's social and economic structure.
2. She championed women rights by appointing women's to key position of government and encourage them to be a part of decision making bodies
3. She expanded healthcare and education and she targeted rural areas aiming to reduce income inequality.
4. Benazir continued her father's Nationalization policy by prioritizing economic sectors but her government attempted to implement structural reforms.
5. Introduced tax and trade reforms and the effort to reduce the state's role in the economy
6. Benazir introduced poverty alleviation programs and launched micro-credit programs to support farmers and small entrepreneurs.
7. Increase defence budget and allow military to control over the nuclear and foreign policy of Pakistan.

During her first rule there was strong authority control of President Gulam Ishaq and Army chief Aslam Baig so she tried to avoid direct confrontation with military leadership on the matters of intelligence and defence. But later on she accused that ISI supported her political opponents like IJI so she replaced (DG)ISI, General Hamid Gul with Lt.Gen. Shamsur Rehman Kallue on 24 May 1989 who was more loyal to PPP. The military reacted to her decision that such strategic positions not be controlled by Benazir Bhutto.

It strains her relationship with president Gulam Ishaq Khan and he dismissed her government in August 1990s by using constitutional power of 58(2)(b). The political chaos damaged the

Democratic norms of Pakistani politics due to frequent dismissal of Prime Ministers because the president held a lot of power in 1993, and the PML-N government also dismissed the president.

### **12:2 The Benazir Bhutto and the election campaign of (1993)**

Benazir Bhutto took advantage of the political weakness of PML-N and re-started her political campaigns against Nawaz's Government.

After the resignation of Nawaz Sharif and Ishaq Khan, Moeen Quarshi worked as PM of the caretaker government, and new elections were announced in October 1993.

This time about 1,485 from different parties ran these elections, Benazir promised welfare schemes, women's empowerment, business initiatives and betterment in foreign relations. PPP used the slogan of Roti, kapra aur Makan frequently.

As a result of the great election campaign of Benazir Bhutto, PPP with its socialist ideology won the 86 NA seats and became the largest winning party of Pakistan.

Benazir again chose the pragmatic approach, making alliance with other parties and secured 121 votes of confidence in the NA so Benazir Bhutto again elected as Prime Minister of Pakistan on October 19, 1993.

Second term of rule of Benazir Bhutto

Benazir Bhutto during her first term faced many difficulties including the allegations of corruption and mismanagement became more conscious during this term of rule.

### **12:3 Reforms of PM Benazir Bhutto during the term of (1993-1996)**

1. Benazir tried to maintain a good relationship with political opponents.
2. Improve law and order.
3. She recovered unpaid loans from bankers, businessmen and landlords.
4. Reduced corruption at the federal level.
5. She made task forces for the betterment of the environment, agriculture and energy sectors.
6. Encouraged foreign companies to invest in Pakistan.
7. Irrigation and agricultural development.
8. Pakistan received military assistance from Sweden and France.
9. Betterment with the relationship of the USA by passing the Brown amendment. This allowed the US government to return the payment of (28) F-16 they also approved \$388 million military support for Pakistan.
10. Electricity generation of 1400 megawatts.
11. Support limited privatization of state owned enterprises which reflects the pragmatic approach of PPP.

### **12:4 Political instability and dismissal of Benazir Bhutto from premiership (1996)**

Despite Benazir's efforts to stabilize the Pakistan economy and to increase the social condition of the masses of Pakistan. GDP fell from 6% to 4%. Pakistani rupee value dropped to 30% against US dollar. Large scale manufacturing growth reduced drastically.

Corruption and financial crisis deteriorated Pakistan economy due to this socialistic agenda of the PPP damaged badly because people of Pakistan suffered badly under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto economically and her personal grudges with military and political opponents further destabilised the social fabric of Pakistan. Ethnic violence in urban Sindh and Karachi and harsh steps against opposition further damaged the position.

Benazir Bhutto's brother, Murtaza Bhutto, was killed on September 20, 1996 and she accused president Farooq Laghari that he had a hand behind Murtaza's death.

This strained her relationship with President Farooq Leghari and he dismissed her from power by using constitutional power of 58(2)(b) on 5 Nov, 1996.



At the end of democratic period from (1988 to 1999), PPP entered into another phase of political pragmatism where they made alliances with political opponents and even with the military.

Benazir Bhutto shifted PPP's ideology from the strict Socialist agenda of her father towards a more pragmatic approach, including improved relations with the United States.

PPP adopted this pragmatic step due to the disintegration of the USSR. After the disintegration of the USSR, the world ceased to be bipolar and entered a unipolar phase dominated by the United States. The era of 1990s was marked by political instability and at the end of this era the Pakistan political dynamics changed abruptly.

During that period, the major leadership of the PPP and other opposition parties went into exile; however, the PPP leadership under Benazir Bhutto even continued their struggle from abroad for the democratic stability in Pakistan. General Pervez Musharraf used the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) to exert pressure on political opponents.

### **13. Alliance for the Restoration of Democracy (ARD) and the pragmatic alliance of PPP (2000)**

Many former GDA parties laid the foundation of a new political alliance, namely the "Alliance for the Restoration of Democracy" (ARD), in Islamabad.

#### **13:1 The major goals of the ARD alliance**

- Restore democracy and the constitution in Pakistan.
- Demand for free, fair and transparent elections.
- Peacefully mobilizing the people against military rule.
- Giving more power to provinces.
- Creating a Commission to investigate past injustice during General Elections.

One of the significant ideological shifts of the Pakistan People's Party was reflected when, under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto, the PPP decided to form an alliance with its major political rival, the PML-N.

PPP jointly participated in the alliance of ARD along with 18 other political opponents including;

PML-N, MQM, ANP and JAH. General Pervez Musharraf used State power to suppress the ARD and arrested its leaders.

General Musharraf held a presidential referendum on April 30, 2002 but PPP including ARD leadership boycotted the referendum. ARD alliance demanded return of Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif to Pakistan. In 2003, PPP strongly opposed the 17th constitutional amendment and Legal Framework Order (LFO). On 14 May 2006, Benazir Bhutto signed the Charter of Democracy (COD) with political opponent Nawaz Sharif (PML-N) in London

### **14. Charter of Democracy (2006)**

It was a 36-point agreement aimed at ending military intervention in politics and strengthening parliamentary democracy in Pakistan.

Key points of Charter of Democracy are

- Repeal of the 17th Constitutional Amendment to restore the parliamentary system.
- Formation of a Judicial Commission for transparent appointment of the judges.
- Abolition of the concurrent list.
- Allocation of reserve seats for women.
- Increased representation of minorities in the Senate.
- Merge FATA with N.W.F.P through constitutional amendment.
- Abolition of the National security council (NSC).
- Accountability of military and judicial officials through the declaration of assets.
- Commitment not to support any dictatorial or anti-democratic move.

In 2007, Musharraf tried to remove the Chief justice of the Supreme Court when he refused to do so, General Musharraf removed him forcefully which resulted in a lawyer's movement against Musharraf. Musharraf was compelled to restore the chief Justice back and announced that new general elections would be held in 2008.

### **15. Benazir Pragmatic decision of signing the National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO)**

Benazir believed in dialogues, preferring cooperation and reconciliation.

Her political pragmatism was reflected when she first signed the Charter of Democracy with political rival Nawaz Sharif and later adopted a more realistic approach by signing a National Reconciliation Ordinance (NRO) with General Musharraf for the Restoration of Democracy & the NRO facilities Benazir for the withdrawal of several pending cases.

#### **15:1 Assassination of Benazir Bhutto**

After NRO, when she returned to Pakistan, Benazir Bhutto was assassinated by anti-democratic forces at Liaquat Bagh, Rawalpindi, on December 27, 2007.

### **16. Political vacuum and the new leadership of PPP**

After the assassination of Benazir Bhutto the Pakistan People's Party faced a huge leadership vacuum filled by Asif Ali Zardari, he acted as co-chairman of PPP and exercised real power of the party while Bilawal Bhutto became Chairman of the party after 2007.

The general election of 2008 rescheduled on February 18, 2008.

PPP and PML-N openly participated in this election.

The manifesto of PPP published before the election of 2008, reflects the clear change in the party's ideology. When PPP entered its fifth decade they largely replaced the strict socialism idea of PPP towards capitalist and liberal economic policies.

They frequently use the slogan of "Democracy is the best revenge".

Public sympathy following Benazir Bhutto's assassination contributed significantly to the PPP's victory in the 2008 general elections.

#### **16:1 The political cooperation and PPP's Government after the elections 2008**

After gaining a majority in the general election of 2008, Asif Ali Zardari took crucial steps to promote political cooperation. Zardari visited Nawaz Sharif at his residence in Lahore, he visited MQM headquarter at Nine Zero, Karachi, Zardari invited MQM and PML-N for coalition Government he also signed the Murree Declaration with PML-N in 2008.

As a result PPP successfully formed a coalition government at federal and provincial levels.

Yousuf Raza Gilani became PM on 25 March, 2008. PPP used strategies of dialogue, discussion, reconciliation and avoided direct confrontation.

#### **16:2 Reforms of Democratic rule of PPP from (2008-2013)**

Under the chairmanship of Bilawal Bhutto and acting co-chairman Asif Ali Zardari PPP performed well during the 2008 general election and formed a coalition government successfully introducing several pragmatic reforms that reflected new energy in PPP politics. This era is often recognized as the "Decade of Pragmatism" where political parties avoid following strict rigidity on their founding ideologies and do whatever is suitable for their sustainable position in politics.

1. Formation of coalition government in center and provincial level to promote political harmony.
2. Signing the Bhurban Accord to ensure democratic continuity.
3. Jointly form government in Sindh with MQM despite clear majority which promotes reconciliation.
4. 18th Constitutional Amendment took place which reduced president power and strengthened the Parliament. Revert the name of N.W.F.P to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

5. Accepted political compromise by changing coalition partners when PML-N left the coalition on the issue of restoration of Supreme Court judges to fill up this gap by forming a coalition with (PML-Q & MQM).
6. For the protection of judges restore deposed judges during the Musharraf period.
7. To improve the recruitment judicial process the PPP Government passed the 19th Amendment.
8. Strengthening of Parliamentary supremacy over presidential power.
9. Passage of 19 Amendment for transparent caretaker government setup.
10. Introduced reforms for Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR).
11. Strengthening of Civil-military relations and avoiding direct confrontation.
12. Initiated counter terrorism operations in Swat and FATA.
13. Introduction of Benazir Income Support Program (BISP).
14. The PPP government Peacefully addresses the Tahir-ul-Qadri protests through dialogue and pragmatic measures, culminating in the signing of the Islamabad long March agreement.

Under the Democratic rule of PPP, Pakistan Government for the first time completed its full five year term of rule and peacefully transferred power to the caretaker government which conducted the upcoming general election of 2013.

### **17. The transition from Socialism to Pragmatism: Contemporary Policy and Political Strategies of the PPP**

#### **17:1 Voting behavior & voting trends of Pakistan**

Voting behavior means how and why people vote in elections it includes,

- **The choice of the voter**
- **Participation**

The choice of the voter to whom an individual decided to vote for while participation means to which party an individual cast a vote, including turnout and election results.

So, the voting behavior gains importance because it affects the outcome of elections and the political system of a country.

#### **17:2 Major factors that influence voting behavior**

- **Economic Forces**
- **Political and institutional factors**
- **Situational factors**
- **Personal factors**

(1) Economic Forces represent income, job security and increasing youth empowerment industrial growth projects that help to eradicate unemployment.

(2) Political parties' organizational structure, their policies, governance performance and leadership qualities incorporated in the political and institutional factors.

(3) Contemporary political dynamics, international trends reflect situational factors.

(4) Education, age or belief system identify personal factors.

All of the factors influence the voting behavior of the masses.

#### **15:3 Voting behavior of Pakistan**

In Pakistan, voting behavior is influenced by major factors such as local Culture, family or clan ties (Biradari System), religion, feudalism, landlords, party loyalty or party manifesto and most contemporary events reflect the influence of social media presence of political leadership also impact on voting behavior of Pakistan.

Pakistan People's Party for the practical implementation introduced several social reforms after the assassination of Benazir Bhutto one of the most influential program launched by PPP was Benazir Income Support Program (BISP)

### **18. PPP's role as an oppositional party(2013-2024)**

The PPP did not perform well in the general election of 2013 some oppositional parties were concerned about the election rigging but PPP adopted a pragmatic (practical and realistic) political approach and peacefully handed power to PML-N.

Asif Ali Zardari decided to boycott the 2013 presidential election in respect for the Supreme Court decision. After the election 2013 PPP successfully formed the provincial government in Sindh along with the support of MQM.

when PML-N faced challenges from PTI and PAT protests in 2014, PPP supported PML-N due to protection of democracy. This demonstrated PPP's role as a "friendly opposition" who works for the political stability in Pakistan.

Between 2013 to 2018, PPP contributed to important constitutional amendments including

- 21st and 23rd Amendments regarding military courts establishment.
- 31st Amendment about the merger of tribal areas with Khyber Pakhtunkwa. PPP cooperates with the government for the sake of National interest.

#### **18:1 Panama Paper case and the PPP's role of strong opponent**

During the Panama Paper case against Nawaz Sharif, PPP strategically cooperated with major oppositional parties like, PTI and PAT due to the changing political conditions.

This step reflects that PPP now shifted from the role of friendly ally towards a strong oppositional role. PPP maintained their independent political nature of their party and play an active role during the nomination of an interim PM.

PPP played a crucial role during the Senate election of 2018. Also actively participated in the changing of CM in Balochistan.

#### **16:2 Decreasing voter bank of PPP & boundness within the Sindh province**

The deep analysis of general election 2013 and 2018 results clearly reflect that Pakistan People's party performed poorly in most of the provinces. As a result of their weak performance and the failure to win many seats outside Sindh.

Their great number of voter banks is limited to Sindh province where they continue to win elections and form the provincial government. PPP has no major win from other provinces like Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkwa and Balochistan.

#### **18:3 PPPs role in Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM)(2020)**

PDM came into power through a no- confidence motion (NCM) against the PM Imran Khan formed in 2020. PPP under the chairmanship of Bilawal Bhutto played an important role in shaping PPP's position at the National level and within the PDM, by emphasizing democratic values, PPP contributes to uniting oppositional parties. PPP participation reflected its pragmatic political approach and collective opposition over individual party interests.

#### **18:4 Major goals of PDM**

- The primary purpose of PDM was to challenge and remove the PTI government led by Imran Khan.
- It wants to restore democratic norms of Pakistan.
- PDM sought to improve Pakistan's economic and political situation through joint oppositional struggle.
- The PDM alliance wanted to demand for free and fair elections.
- The PDM aims to unite diverse opposition parties under one platform.
- The PDM wants to mobilise the masses of Pakistan through demonstration, speeches and media engagement.

In April 2021, the Pakistan People's Party left the PDM because of serious disagreements within the alliance.



The main reason behind this withdrawal was the strategy of mass resignations from Parliament. PPP didn't agree with this plan because this decision would weaken democracy and reduce the opposition's role inside the system.

However PDM successfully achieved its goal of removing the PTI government through a no-confidence motion in April 2021.

The PPP distanced itself from the alliance due to policy disagreements more commonly government policies, economic decisions and distribution of political power within the coalition partners.

### **19. PPP Polics and contemporary role**

Benazir Income Support program of PPP was introduced during the fifth decade of Pakistan People's Party politics under the constitutional government rule from 2008-2013. It was the first social protection program in Pakistan aimed at providing financial support to poor women, helping them meet their monthly living expenses.

After this project success people of Pakistan with their voting strength tilted towards PPP.

BISP strengthens public support, this program creates a sense of loyalty among beneficiaries.

PPP under the shift of ideology from Socialism to Pragmatism also improved the condition of the rural class, especially the farmers. Pakistan moved from wheat shortage to become a wheat exporting country because PPP leadership always stood by the farmers, they advocate for timely procurement and fair prices.

Bilawal Bhutto; Chairman of PPP is ready to cooperate in the effort of reducing the electricity prices in the country.

When PPP during their term of rule (2008-2013) successfully implemented the 18th Amendment then Sindh and other provinces started sales tax services the number of tax collections increased rather than the previous tax collection only by the federation. According to PPP it was the clear example of benefits of decentralization.

PPP on the other hand laid the foundation of (CPEC) China Pakistan Economic corridor with the aim of benefiting Pakistan and its people.

Bilawal Bhutto served as Foreign Minister from April, 2022 until the National Assembly was dissolved in August 2023.

In his capacity as PPP Chairman after the end of Foreign Minister term, Bilawal Bhutto highlighted the importance of Pakistan's "**General Scheme of Preference plus**" (GSP+) trade status with the European Union. Bilawal Bhutto stated that this status has contributed to an 80% increase in Pakistan's exports to Europe, while Europe exports to Pakistan increased by about 60%. This reflects how keenly PPP leadership focus on economic possibilities of Pakistan.

Pakistan exports to the EU gradually from 2014-2022 increased by 108%.

These efforts and pragmatic approach of PPP leadership reflects that PPP while following a pragmatic approach, the PPP continues to uphold socialist principles. Even today, PPP's manifesto of roti, kapra and makan, is still their leading manifesto.

### **20. Conclusion**

This journal Article has examined the ideological evaluation of the Pakistan People's Party (PPP) from its foundation in 1967 to 2024, tracing its ideological transformation from a socialist mass-based political movement into a pragmatic, a system-oriented political party.

The analysis demonstrated that the ideological shifts within the PPP were neither accidental nor abrupt; instead, they happened gradually because Pakistan's political dynamics kept changing.

Changing domestic political conditions, global ideological impacts, institutional constraints, and the need for the party to stay politically relevant all influenced these changes.

The PPP emerged as a radical response to structural inequality, elite domination, and authoritarian governance in Pakistan.

Under the leadership of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, the PPP presented a new political vision based on socialism, democracy and the power of the people.

By mobilizing workers, peasants, students, and marginalized classes through a populist socialist discourse by advocating their everyday problems.

The slogan Roti, kapra aur Makan symbolized this slogan reputed PPP as a people centric political party.

However, the study finds that the PPP's socialistic ideology faced resistance from religious groups, administrative weaknesses, economic mismanagement, and political repression forced the party to modify its ideological stance.

The early form of ideological pragmatism, reflects the introduction of Islamic socialism, an early effort of party leadership to reconcile socialistic principles with Pakistan religious and cultural realities. Pakistan People's party shifted away from ideological confrontation toward political accommodation, signaling the beginning of its long transition from Socialism to Pragmatism.

Benazir Bhutto reshaped the PPP into a democratic and pragmatic party adjusting its ideology to survive under military influence and institutional pressure marking a shift from revolutionary socialism to social democracy.

During the fifth decade of PPP, leadership of PPP clearly adopted a pragmatic approach by focusing on reconciliation, constitutional reforms, coalition government, and democratic continuity resulting in the completion of a full civilian term from 2008 to 2013. The implementation of 18th Constitutional Amendment reflects the PPP commitment to democracy, supporting parliamentary power and provincial rights.

Between 2013 to 2024, the PPP played a role of major oppositional power and focused mainly on Sindh politics, and focus on (BISP), and participation in alliances.

Under the Chairmanship of Bilawal Bhutto, the party has worked on modern issues like economic diplomacy, decentralization, and global trade while Asif Ali Zardari holds the position of President of Pakistan after the 2024 general election.

Overall, the deep study of PPP's political journey clearly shows an evaluation rather than a complete abandonment of socialism.

By balancing pragmatism with its foundational commitment to social justice, the PPP can continue to play a stabilizing role in Pakistan's democracy and remain a relevant political force in the years ahead.

## Bibliography

### Books and Theses

1. Bhurgri, Abdul Ghafoor. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: The Falcon of Pakistan. Reproduced by Sani H. Panhwar, Member Sindh Council, Pakistan Peoples Party, 2020.
2. Curtis, John. Politics in Pakistan 2022–24 and Upcoming Elections. Research Briefing. House of Commons Library, 13 February 2024. <https://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/CBP-9883/CBP-9883.pdf>.
3. Farooq, Shujaat, Azizul Muhammad Aslam, and Nadeem Ul Haq. Political Party Manifestos: Reform Paradox in Pakistan. Islamabad: Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, 2024.
4. Gilani, Bilal, ed. Gilani's Index of Electoral Record, 1970–2013. Vol. 1, Pakistan National Election: 1970. Islamabad: Gallup Pakistan, 2013.
5. Lodhi, Maleeha. Bhutto: *The Pakistan Peoples Party and Political Development in Pakistan*, 1967–1977. PhD diss., University of London, 1981.
65. Mason, David S. A Concise History of Modern Europe: *Liberty, Equality, Solidarity*. 2nd ed. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2011.
6. Manifesto of *Pakistan People's Party*, 1970 & 1977 Reproduced by Sani Hussain Panhwar.

7.Zaman, Fakhar, and Akhtar Aman. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: The Political Thinker. Reproduced by Sani Hussain Panhwar, Member Sindh Council, Pakistan People's Party, 1973.

[https://sanipanhwar.com/uploads/books/2024-08-27\\_10-56-10\\_02cf440da3b1b8c84444930dc96d2e44.pdf](https://sanipanhwar.com/uploads/books/2024-08-27_10-56-10_02cf440da3b1b8c84444930dc96d2e44.pdf).

### **Grey Literature**

1.Pakistan Peoples Party. 2008. Towards Peace and Prosperity in Pakistan: Manifesto 2008. Karachi: Pakistan Peoples Party. <https://www.pppp.org.pk/manifestos/manifesto2008.pdf>.

2.Pakistan Peoples Party. 2024. Chuno Nai Soch Ko: Manifesto 2024. Islamabad: Pakistan Peoples Party. <https://pppp.org.pk/website/wp-content/uploads/2024/01/Manifesto-2024.pdf>.

### **Journal Articles & Research Papers**

1.Azeem, Muhammad, Mukhtar Ahmad, and Tahir Tabassum. "A Sneaking Exposure to Premiumship through Politics of Tactics and Compromises: Civil-Military Relationship during Benazir Bhutto's Government 1988–90." *Pakistan Social Sciences Review* 3, no. 1 (June 2019):pp. 663–672.

2.Ahmed, Jalil, Sajid Hussain Tumrani, and Kashif Ahmed.

"Ideological Transformation in Pakistan People's Party: From Z.A. Bhutto to Asif Ali Zardari (1970–2013)." *Journal of Positive School Psychology* 6, no. 9 (2022):pp. 5073–5083. <http://journalppw.com>.

3.Azeem, Muhammad, and Mukhtar Ahmad. "The Saga of Benazir Bhutto's Premiership 1988–90 & 1993–96." *Journal of Politics and International Studies* 7, no. 1 (January–June 2021): pp.115–124. <https://jpis.pu.edu.pk/45/article/view/99>

4.Begum, Khursheed, Muhammad Aslam Faiz, and Sohail Akhtar. "Analytical Study of the Governance and Politics of PML-Q, 2002–2007." *Competitive Social Sciences Research Journal* 3, no. 2 (2020):pp.1–17.

5.Behan, Ronaque Ali, and Mukesh Kumar Khatwani. "Impact of Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) on Voting Behavior of Women in District Sanghar." *Journal of Education and Social Studies*, 140–149. <https://www.scienceimpactpub.com/jess>.

6.Chawla, Muhammad Iqbal, and Aman Ullah. "The Politics of Pragmatism in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan People's Party." *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture* 39, no. 1 (2018): 1–14.

7.Chawla, Muhammad Iqbal. "Era of 'Reconciliation' in Pakistan, 2006–2017: A Critical Reappraisal." *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan* 54, no. 2 (July–December 2017): 239–248.

8.Dawood, Muhammad, and Kasif Shahzad Naqvi. "Political Parties in Pakistan: A Case Study of the Pakistan Peoples Party." *TGT Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research* 3 (2017).

9.Gohar, Shaista, Safia Jawad, Hasnain Sajid, Tasnem Sarwar, and Usama Ullah. "Role of Pakistan Peoples Party in Politics of Pakistan 2008–2018: A Decade of Pragmatism." *Webology* 19, no. 1 (2022). <https://www.webology.org/data->

10.Gohar, Shaista, Safia Jawad, Nida Zahid, Zaib Un Nisa, and Anbareen.

"Role of Pakistan Peoples Party in Political Alliances of Pakistan Against Military Regimes (1967–2008): An Assessment." *Journal of Positive School Psychology* 7, no. 1 (2023): 1101–1110. <http://journalppw.com>.

11.Hassan, Muhammad. "1965 Indo-Pakistan War: An Overview." *International Journal of Human and Society (IJHS)* 4, no. 1 (January–March 2024): 759–770. <https://ijhs.com.pk/index>.

12.Hassan, Muhammad, Muhammad Rizwan, and Sadaf Butt. "General Elections of 1993: A Thriving Riposte of Democracy in Pakistan." *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan* 56, no. 21 (July–December 2019): 423–450.

13.Hughes, Libby. *Benazir Bhutto: From Prison to Prime Minister*. Minneapolis, MN: Dillon Press, Inc., 1990.

14.Hussain, Maya. "Leading as a Woman: The Life and Legacy of Benazir Bhutto." *Research Archive of Rising Scholars*, 1–8. Accessed December 17, 2025. <https://research-archive.org/index.php/rars/preprint/view/3233>.

- 15.Khan, Bakhtiar, Arif Khan, and Irfan Khan. "The Crisis of Governance in Pakistan: A Critical Analysis of Benazir Bhutto Government (1988–1990)." *Global Political Review* 4, no. 3 (2019): 10–19. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2019\(IV-III\).0](https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2019(IV-III).0)
- 16.Khan, Bakhtiar, and Saeed Ahmad. "Government-Oppositions Relations during First Term of Benazir Bhutto as Prime Minister." *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research* (SJESR) 1, no. 1 (January–June 2018):pp.77-90.
- 17.Khan, Amjad Abbas, and Mehboob Alam. "Charter of Democracy: A Good Omen for the Democratization in Pakistan." *Pakistan Vision* 17, no. 2 (2016): 293–317. [https://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/studies/PDF-FILES/Artical%2014\\_v17\\_2\\_dec17.pdf](https://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/studies/PDF-FILES/Artical%2014_v17_2_dec17.pdf).
- 18.Khan, Benish. "Grass Roots (Islamic Socialism & the Upsurge of Pakistan Peoples' Party)." *Biannual Research Journal* 55, no. 2 (2021): 40–56.
19. Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) Government through the Lens of Print Media: Exploring the Predominant Narratives." *Global Social Sciences Review* 9, no. 1 (Winter 2024): 1–15. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2024\(IX-I\)](https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2024(IX-I)).
- 20.Sangharo, Refi Raza, and Jalil Ahmed Chandio. "Emerging the Concept of Islamic Socialism in Pakistan: Historical Analysis on Political Debates of 1970–1971 Election Campaign." *Journal of History, Culture and Art Research*.
- 21.Shah, Syed Akmal Hussain. "Ideological Orientation of Pakistan People's Party: Evolution, Illusion and Reality." *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan* 55, no. 2 (2018)
- 22.Zulfiqar ali bhutto's era (1971-1977) | PPTX <https://share.google/0XbGEB2g2bZTsj6vk>

#### Links

##### 1.Link

PAKISTAN: parliamentary elections National Assembly, 1988

<https://share.google/97nnzyeJ18mpthu7T>

##### 2.Link

Benazir Bhutto's PM Tenure Analysis | PDF | Benazir Bhutto | Pakistan

<https://share.google/zZMjrDGpkWNoMIGTg>

##### 3.Link

Pakistan Elections 2013: Is PPP's Decline Momentary? | IPCS

<https://share.google/W6eqKjTrgD5cdq7aS>

##### 4.Link

The Peculiar Case of the Pakistan Peoples Party as an Opposition Party | Carnegie Endowment for International Peace <https://share.google/H1SX2wJrV3TJ9p3I5>

##### 5.Link

PPP reaffirms commitment to farmers - Pakistan - DAWN.COM

<https://share.google/LFtfFIOpRgDBtgUdN>

##### 6.Link

Every province should have representation in FBR:Bilawal -Business Recorder

<https://share.google/f1RL15LkA48TFCglA>

##### 7.Link

The European Union Releases The Fourth GSP Report: Evaluating Implementation of 27 International Conventions in Beneficiary Countries, including Pakistan | EEAS

<https://share.google/6e7GnOA8BLGL0N4uW>